
Dubbing Analysis Of Movie Clips And Video Games From English Into Indonesia By Fans

^{1*}Muhammad Aprianto Budie Nugroho, Erwin Oktoma², Vina Agustiana³

English Education Program, Universitas Kuningan

English Education Program, Universitas Kuningan

English Education Program, Universitas Kuningan

Corresponding Author: Muhammad Aprianto Budie Nugroho E-mail: muh.apriantobn@uniku.ac.id

ARTICLE INFO

Received: 07-01-2022

Revised: 14-02-2022

Published: 30-03-2022

Volume: 5

Issue: 1

DOI:

<https://doi.org/10.33019/berumpun.v4i2.90>

KEYWORDS

*Translation, dubbing, fans, movie clips,
video games*

ABSTRACT

Dubbing translation research is one of the translation studies in Audio Visual Translation (AVT) that has not been widely discussed, especially with dubbing which is carried out by fans. In this research, the researcher will examine the dubbing done by fans in translating short clips from western films, they are divided into two groups; fandubbing and fan dubbing. The fandubbing are Fathur Bysmi and Fluxcup, while fan dubbing are Raihan Hakim98 and Ky Ameron. Fathur Bysmi dubbed movie clip from *Spiderman* movie, while Fluxcup dubbed one of Batman TV series entitled *Batman the Batus*. Raihan Hakim98 dubbed video clip from *Resident Evil III* game, while Ky Ameron dubbed a video clip from the movie entitled *Frozen*. Based on findings, it can be seen that the two Fundubbing dubbers are poor in translation quality, because they more focused on having fun and not on meaning. On the other hand, the Fandubbing dubbers are better at both of dubbing and translation quality. Both of fandubbing and fan dubbing are able to maintain synchronization between the voice and lips, as well as synchronization in gestures or kinetic.

1.INTRODUCTION

Movie is one of the most important audio-visual media since its creation in the early 20th century until now. Besides, it is also considered as an effective audio-visual media in introducing a culture. It can be enjoyed by various groups and ages all over the world starting from the golden age of cinema from the 50s to the present in the era of streaming films on various online devices, such as YouTube, Viu, Netflix and so on. However, problems arise when the movies are in foreign languages, for instance, the English movies. This becomes a problem since not all Indonesian are fluent in using English as foreign language.

The difference in language and culture is one of the obstacles faced by the audience in understanding the contents of the story. To overcome this problem, a translation between source language (English) to target language (Indonesian) is needed. There are two type translations in the movie, namely subtitling and dubbing. Subtitling and dubbing are the two most frequently used types of movie translation in Indonesia. However, it is uncommon for a movie to be translated using two different ways because they have different functions. Dubbing is aimed at helping viewers who have low reading skills while subtitling is the

reverse. Therefore, most movies for adults use subtitling, while children movies are mostly translated by dubbing.

Dubbing, also known as language replacement, replaces the target language spoken by the actors or actresses. In dubbing, voice-over services recorded by professional voice actors mimic the actor's expressions, pitch and lip syncing on-screen in a different language. In this study, researchers have analysed dubbing or voice-over which is usually performed by a voice-over company using sophisticated equipment and performed by professional voice-over actors. There are several research related with dubbing such as Ariska et al (2022), and also Aulia et al (2022) most of those researches focus on dubbing or dubbing process which are conducted by professional dubbing company services, while there are only several studies or researches are conducted to study on dubbing conducted by amateur group such as fans.

There are some dubbings are conducted frequently by fans and amateur translators (Cintas, 2013). The emergence of this has been discussed by several researchers, such as Fansubbing by Rong et al (2018), Nugroho et al (2019), Lesmana et al (2022), Tee et al (2022), and fandubbing by Dore et al (2021). However, Cintas and Orero in Peres Gonzales (2020) emphasized that "there are still few studies that examine the practice of collaborative fandubbing, which consists of free distribution via the internet of audio-visual programs, especially dubbing of a Japanese anime film that is dubbed by fans for fans" (Chaune, 2013). However, considers fandubbing as a new genre in AVT, which needs deeper exploration.

The translation which was done by fans was first seen in Japanese anime subtitling which can be traced back to 1980 (Hagan in Saejang, 2021), due to technological limitations including the ease of obtaining software Cintaz and Sanchez in Dwyer (2019). Nowadays, through the existence of various technological developments, rendition carried out by fans is found with various types of translation. According to and Gambier (2013), renderings by fans and non-experts are striking from crowdsourcing from websites such as Facebook and LinkedIn. The translations carried out by fans and amateur are not paid; although it cannot be denied that some of them are professional translators in the field of translation and interpreting (Izwani, 2014).

Fandubbing is usually done by fans for fun not for commercial purpose. One of research on dubbing carried out by fans is the research conducted by Nord et al (2015). They conducted a case study of socio-cultural and technical problems in non-expert dubbing. In their research, they explained the quality and technique that fans do in producing dubbing and their background in dubbing movies or movie fragments. The dubbing movies are usually posted on the Youtube channel.

In this study, researchers examine the results of fan dubbing from English into Indonesian language carried out by several fans posted on the Youtube channel. There are three categories of fan dubbing, described by Nord et al, namely fundubbing, fandubbing, and quasi-professional dubbing. The three categories of dubbing are carried out by fans with different backgrounds and goals. In addition, researchers focused on the dubbing quality as well as dubbing synchronization. Chaune in PerEGo (2014) identifies three types of synchronization: lip synchronicity, kinetic synchronicity, and isochrony. Isochrony is synchronization of the duration of translation with the speech of characters. In other words,

the translation must match the moment the characters open their mouths and the moment they close their mouths. In addition, in this study, the researcher also tried to find out the background of the fans in doing the dubbing.

3. METHODOLOGY

Regarding the research objectives, this study used qualitative research. According to Creswell (2009), qualitative research is a process of inquiry to understand based on differences in research methodological traditions in exploring a social or human problem. Researchers build a complex view, holistic picture, word analysis, detailed reports seen from informants and natural or natural actions. Darlington and Scott (2002) add that qualitative research is how researchers construct questions, and work through steep areas both ethically and politically, systematically collect appropriate data, analyse them rigidly and disseminate the findings and implications of research.

Furthermore, this research applied a case study design. Case study is a research design found in various fields, especially evaluation, in which the researchers develop an in-depth analysis of a case be it a program, event, activity, process or an individual (Creswell, 2009). In this study, researchers examined the quality of dubbing and their translation quality from the results of fan dubbing carried out by several fans on the YouTube channel, such as Fatur Bysmi, Fluxcup, Raihan Hakim98 and Ky Ameron. The data were collected through in the form video clip from their YouTube account.

4. RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

As previously stated, this study examined the quality of dubbing translation and dubbing synchronization carried out by fans, namely Fatur Bysmi, Raihan Hakim98, Fluxcup, and Ky Ameron. The four dubbers are in the fandubbing category expressed by Nord et al (2015), namely fundubbing, fandubbing, and quasi-professional dubbing. The four fan dubbers fall into two categories, namely the fundubbing and fandubbing categories. This can be seen from the length of the clips dubbed by the voice actors which are clips from cartoons or clips from video games with an average duration of 20 seconds to 8 minutes.

The first group, namely Fundubbing, was carried out by Fatur Bysmi and Fluxcup. The two fan dubbers translated the movie clips. The film entitled Spiderman, starring by Tobey Maguire, was dubbed into Indonesian by Fatur Bysmi while the 1960 Batman TV series, starring Adam West, was dubbed by Fluxcup. It is interesting that the dubbing done by Fatur Bysmi and friends was done by several people including an editor; however, unfortunately, the quality of the dubbing was still poor. As the result, the translation quality were poor. the poor quality on dubbing conducted by Fatur Bysmi and his group could be caused by technical issue. Besides, there were two people who dubbed the main character, Mr. Osborn and the Goblin, who are the alter ego figures of Mr. Osborn. This is one of dubbing found in the early scenes. Based on these, it can be concluded that there was domestication in translating from English into Indonesian in Fatur Bysmi and friends dubbing process.

Table 1. Dubbing Performed by Fathur Bysmi et al

Character	Source Language	Target Language
Peter	<i>Hey stop the bus...tell him to stop!</i>	<i>Hey..pak, hey pak</i>
Parker/Agon	<i>Please!..hey stop the bus!</i>	<i>berentiin bisnya pak! Woi sudah capek nih gua lari! Wooi berentiin bisnya!</i>
Marry Jane/Juminah	<i>Stop the bus! He's been chasing the bus since Woodhaven</i>	<i>Denger nggak sih bereentiin bisnya tolol!</i>
Figuran 1	<i>Don't even think about it</i>	<i>Hei ini bekas mencretku tadi</i>

Based on Table 1, it can be seen that the accuracy of the dubbing translation is not good, and it is not accurate with the source language, it can be seen when they translate Mary Jane dialog "Stop the bus! He's been chasing the bus since Woodhaven" with "Denger nggak sih bereentiin bisnya tolol!" in English mean "Do you listen it stop the bus idiot!! ". Beside that the language style used is the language style of teenagers which, in fact, all of dubbers are high school students. In the mouth synchronization between the voice of the dubbing and the lips of the character in the dubbing is not sync, even though in professional dubbing it is not easy to synchronize the voice with the lips. On the other hand, even though between the source language and the target language are very different and inaccurate, Fatur Bysmi is able to synchronize the movements with lip and voice movements. Domestication can be seen in the dubbing result by using several words such as *mencretku*.

Picture 1. Parker's hand movement



Table 2. Dubbing Fathur Bystmi et al

Character	Source Language	Target Language
Peter	Go	<i>Bissmilahirohmannirohi</i>
Parker/Agon	web!...fly!...appaparwei	<i>m...astagfirulloh...ababa</i>
	web!!...Shazam!...go!...go!	<i>nyihui...maak..gunting..k</i>
	go web go!..	<i>ertas..batu..nyiu...nyiu..</i>

Based on table 2, it can be seen that the dubbing performed by Fathur bismi et al did not really pay attention to the accuracy of the dubbing. It is implied in Table 2 that the meaning is different between the source language and the target language. It is also supported by Picture 1 which shows the verbalizing of Parker's hand movements in which in the original version there is no voice. The most interesting part in that dubbing result is the used of Islamic pry such as *Bissmilahirohmannirohim* and *astagfirulloh* in translating *go web* and *appaparwei*, the last word doesn't has anymeaning in Indonesia.

The domestication of the dubbing conducted by Fathur Bismi as it mention before can be seen from the changes of the character names in the movie by Indonesian name such as Peter Parker become Agon, Marry Jane become Jamileh, Mr. Osborn become Pak Toto, Harry Osborne become Agus. The dubbing of the movie clip can be seen in the table below.

Table 3. Dubbing by Fathur Bystmi et al

Character	Source Language	Target Language
Harry Osborne/Agus	<i>Can we drop around corner please?</i>	<i>Pak mules pingin berak.</i>
Mr. Osborne/pak Toto	<i>Why? The entrance is right there?</i>	<i>Berak no minta anterin sama temen lu noh.</i>
Harry Osborne/Agus	<i>Dad this a public school kid, I can't show up on fied trip with Rols</i>	<i>Yah malu apa berak disekolah nanti kalau ketemu jamileh gimana?</i>
Mr. Osborne/pak Toto	<i>Do you want me to trade my car for jetta just because you fled out every private school I sent you?</i>	<i>Hhmm juminah lagi, juminah lagi tadi dirumah berak sudah cebok belum sih?masih bau loh.</i>
Harry Osborne/ Agus	<i>It wasn't for me</i>	<i>Sudah cebok kok tadi</i>
Mr. Osborne/pak Toto	<i>Of course it was</i>	<i>Ah masa masih bau lho</i>

From that table 3, it can be seen that the translation in the dubbing conducted by Fathur bysmi is not accurate between the source language into target language it can be seen from

Harry Osborne dialog translation which is “*Can we drop around corner please?*” it translated into Indonesia “*Pak mules pingin berak*” in English means “*Dad I my stomach ache I want to take a shit*”. Domestication in the dubbing can be seen from the use local name Juminah which supposed to Mary jane, and several words that are considered as acceptable in Indonesian language such as *berak* or in English mean defacate, and *cebok* or in English mean wipe. Those words rarely use by Indonesian in formal situation. The poor quality of dubbing in that movie clip conducted by Fathur bysmi can be caused by inedaquate hardware and software. While inaccurate and unacceptable in translation quality can be caused of editor translation ability and the purpose of Fathur Bysmi dubbing. The dubbing of the movie clip is conducted by a group of teenagers, and the purpose of this dubbing is for having fun.

The second fundubbing is carried out by fluxcup or the Fluxcup Institute. The name fluxcup is quite well known in the world of dubbing and has dubbed a lot of various movie clips. Fluxcup usually dubs short clips that are less than 5 minutes in lenght and aims to be entertaining. They don't focus on explaining the meaning. One of which is in dubbing the Batman film, originally entitled Batman The Batus, which was replaced with BadBat Mabu Batusi.

Table 4. Dubbing by Fluxcup

Character	Source Language	Target Language
Woman 1	<i>Clif it's Batman!</i>	<i>Arip ada Batman!</i>
Woman 2	<i>Is there anyting I can do for you sir? Take your cape.</i>	<i>Eh..mas..mas..boleh minta waktunya saya jual hape</i>
Batman		<i>Nggak dah punya.</i>
Man 1	<i>Ringside table Batman?</i>	<i>Bos..bos inget saya ngga?</i>
Batman	<i>I just like tanks, I stay at the Bar, I should not attract any attention</i>	<i>Oh iya, iya, iya, yang kemarin keracunan kan</i>

The results of the dubbing carried out by Fluxcup focus on translating a movie from English into Indonesian, but focus on entertaining the audience. It can be seen from the translation accuracy of their dubbing, it can be seen from the woman number 2 dialog translation “*Is there anyting I can do for you sir? Take your cape*” into Indonesia “*Eh..mas..mas..boleh minta waktunya saya jual hape*” in English mean “*eh..mas...mas..may I ask your time, I sell Handphone*”, the word *mas* itself derives javanese word used to address or refer to contemporary males, including wife to husband. Besides, the music background is different from the original version in which the original music was pop music while Fluxcup used dangdut. In addition, they even attached the prayers '*bismillahironmanirohim*' and '*astagfirulloh*' in their dubbing. Futhermore, they also converted the name of Cliff to Arip which is commonly used by Indonesian, and put the nick name “*mas*” which is originally Javanese in their dubbing. Therefore, it can be seen that there was domestication in the dubbing carried out by Fluxcup.

Instead of what has been discussed, Fluxcup is able to synchronize the voice and lip movements of the characters in the dubbed film. In addition, in the dubbing results Fluxcup

also succeeds in kinetic synchronization, especially when the scene is on a bar table that is as can be seen in Picture 2.

Picture 2. BadBat Mabu Batusi



In Picture 2, it can be seen that the woman is blocking Batman's steps. Even though in the original scene there is no voice in the woman's movement, but Fluxcup added the conversation in that scene. The woman says "*eeh, where are you going, where are you going, I am going to block.*" The movements and voices of women dressed in black are synchronous. In terms of quality, the dubbing results of Fluxcup are better than the dubbing done by Fatur Bysmi. The interesting thing in Fluxcup's dubbing is when they attached Indonesian local wisdom, such as the using of local names, and showing Indonesian daily lives, such as defecating, eating indomie using eggs, and using dangdut as the background music of their video clip.

On the other hand, the results of the translation carried out by two other object of research which are Raihan Hakim98 and Ky Ameron have been classified into Fandubbing. Raihan Hakim98 dubbed one of the scenes in the video game Resident Evil 3 which lasted 13 minutes 30 seconds. The dubbing performed by Raihan Hakim and his friends were synchronized meaningfully and physically in sync between the voice and the lips. Besides, the meaning is synchronous between source language to the target language. This can be see in Table 5.

Table 5. Fluxcup dubbing

Character	Source Language	Target Language
Carlos	I think we're clear	<i>Kurasa kita sudah jauh darinya</i>
Valentine	I hope so	<i>Semoga kau benar</i>
Carlos	We've been bringing survivor here	<i>Warga lainnya sudah ada disini</i>
Valentine	Here, where	<i>Maksudmu</i>
Carlos	My guys have converted some subways cars into shuttle..... it's save	<i>Timku sudah merubah sebuah tempat menjadi kereta pengungsian sudah aman</i>

Valentine	I am fine	<i>Aku tak apa</i>
Carlos	Ok, Personal space I get it, let's go	<i>Iyah aku paham, bukan muhrim kan, ayo sebelah sini</i>

As can be seen from the translation results for dubbing carried out by Raihan Hakim98 in Table 4, the dubbing quality of the video clip is quite good, and the synchronization between mouth and voice is good except at the end clip when the Russian commander Carlos looks lip synchronization and the voice is still a little out of sync. This can be seen in Picture 3. Besides, Raihan Hakim98 manages to keep the Russian accent of the character. In addition, the kinetic synchronization in the dub is good, although the dubbing quality is still below standard, it could be due to the hardware and software they use.

Picture 3. Resident Evil III Video Game



There is something interesting in the results of Raihan Hakim9's dubbing which is the use of the phrase "*not muhrim*" in translating of the phrase "Ok, personal space". It shows the influence of local culture, especially among muslim Indonesian to describe the relationship between man and woman. Thus it can be stated that there is the domestication in the translation performed by Raihan Hakim98.

The next dubbing was done by Ky Ameron. Ky Ameron translated various cartoon films, some of which were taken from Disney movie clips, namely Frozen with a duration of 2 minutes, 25 seconds. The movie clip is taken from one of the song in the movie *Frozen*. The dubbing done by Ky Ameron is considered as the best performance among the 4 participants. The results are synchronous in terms of meaning and synchronization. The translation in dubbing done by Ky Ameron et al has good quality. This can be seen in Table 6.

Table 6. Ky Ameron dubbing

Character	Source Language	Target Language
Anna	Wait, wait, so you have ... How many brother	<i>Tunggu, tunggu, jadi kau punya berapa saudara?</i>
Hans	Twelve my older brothers, three of them pretending I am not	<i>Dua belas kakaku pria, tiga diantaranya berpura-pura aku tidak</i>

	exist, literally, for two years	<i>ada secara harfiah, selama dua tahun</i>
Anna	That's horrible!	<i>Itu mengerikan</i>
Hans	It is such brothers!	<i>Itulah saudara pria</i>
Anna	Sisters too	<i>Saudara wanita juga</i>

It can be seen in Table 5 that the quality of the dubbing translation from Ky Ameron is accurate and acceptable with the source language and the target language, besides that the synchronization between the lips and the voice is well synchronized. and kinetic synchronization accordingly, and in the clip there is also a singing section which the results are very good in both translation quality and dubbing quality.

Based on the information presented, it can be seen that the dubbing carried out by Fundubbing emphasized more on entertainment and fun in line with the word "Fun". In Fundubbing, their emphasis was not on translating the language from English into Indonesian. Dubbing carried out by the two groups of fans, namely Fatur Bysmi and Fluxcup, focused on having fun and finding experiences. Thus, they include this in their self-description on their Youtube site vlog.

Whereas in the second group, which is Fandubbing, the results of their dubbing were meaningfully in accordance with the source language and the target language. Besides that the synchronization between the voice and lip movements was synchronous, and the kinetic synchronization between the voice and the movement was appropriate and synchronous.

5. CONCLUSION

Based on the explanation shown in discussion, it can be concluded that the research on dubbing carried out by the two groups, the Fundubbing group which consists of Fathur Bysmi and Fluxcup, and the Fandubbing group which consist of Raihan Hakim98 and Ky Ameron. The fandubbing conducted by Raihan Hakim98 and Ky Ameron showed the quality of synchronization between lip movements and dubber voices. On other hand the dubbing conducted by Fathur bysmi and fluxcup are considered dubbed poorly, because the dubbing conducted by Fathur bysmi and Fluxcup change the entire movie dialog and the backsound of the video clips. The translation quality conducted by fundubbing is considered inaccurate, and unacceptable due to their purpose of the fundubbing in dubbing their video clips, is for having fun. The total changes on the translating of their dubbing and the backsound of video clip by both of fundubbing groups make impossible for the viewer to understand the meaning from source language into target language of the movie clip.

The dubbing on video clip in video from part of the movie and video games conducted by Fandubbing's dubber, namely Raihan Hakim98 and Ky Ameron, is close to the result of professional dubbing from voice and lip synchronization as well as kinetic synchronization or gestures with sound. Their translation is considered accurate and acceptable between the source language which is English language into target languagege which is Indonesian language. Both of fundubbing and fandubbing are able to to maintain synchronization between the voice and lips, as well as synchronization in gestures or kinetic but the fundubbing failed to translate their dubbing correctly.

REFERENCES

- Ariska, D., Nugroho, M. A. B., & Asikin, N. A. (2022). IDIOMS TRANSLATION ANALYSIS IN THE DUBBING OF MULAN MOVIE. *Indonesian EFL Journal*, 8(2), 215-222.
- Aulia, A., & Nugroho, R. A. (2022). Comparative Translation Analysis of Subtitle and Dubbing in "Raya and the Last Dragon". *Journal of English Language Teaching and Linguistics*, 7(3), 577-596.
- Chaume, F. (2013a). Plenary lecture: Translation for dubbing: Expanding borders. Paper presented at the Media For All 5 ,Dubrovnik, Croatia.
- Cintas, D. J. (2013). *Subtitling: Theory practice and reserach*. In C. Millán & F. Bartrina (Eds.), *The routledge handbook of translation studies* (pp. 273-287). Abingdon, England: Routledge
- Creswell, J. W. (2009). *Qualitative Inquiry and Research Design: Choosinamon Five Traditions*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage
- Darlington, Y. and Scott, D. (2002). *Qualitative Research in Practice*. Newsouth Wales: Allen and Unwin
- Díaz-Cintas, J., & Massidda, S. (2019). Technological advances in audiovisual translation. Dore, M., & Petrucci, A. (2022). Professional and amateur AVT. The Italian dubbing, subtitling and fansubbing of The Handmaid's Tale. *Perspectives*, 30(5), 876-897.
- Dwyer, T. (2019). Audiovisual translation and fandom. *The Routledge handbook of audiovisual translation*, 436-452.
- Gambier, Y. (2014). Changing landscape in translation. *International Journal of Society, Culture & Language*, 2(2), 1-12
- Izwani, S. (2014). Amateur translation in Arabic-speaking cyber space. *Perspective studies in Translatology*, 22(1), 96-112
- Lesmana, C., Nugroho, M. A. B., Rahmatunisa, W., & Arbain, A. (2022). Directive Speech Act Translation Analysis in "The Lion King" Movie. *Borneo Educational Journal (Borju)*, 4(2), 58-69.
- Pérez-González, L. (2020). Fan audiovisual translation. *Routledge encyclopedia of translation studies*, 172-177.
- Matamala, Anna. (2017). Dubbing versus subtitling yet again? An empirical study on user comprehension and preference in Spain. *Federation des traductures (FIT), Babel* 63: 3, 423-441.
- Nugroho, M. A. B., & Shepia, S. T. (2019). A comparative analysis of translation strategies on slang words in the movie Deadpool 2 between internet fansub and professional translators. *Leksika: Jurnal Bahasa, Sastra dan Pengajarannya*, 13(2), 89-94.
- Nord, C., Khoshaligheh, M., and Saeed, A. (2015). Socio-cultural and Technical Issues in Non-Expert Dubbing: A Case Study. *International Journal of Society, Culture & Language*. 3(2)
- PEReGo, E. (2014). Humour and audiovisual translation: an overview. *Translating Humour in Audiovisual Texts*. Bern: Peter Lang, 9.

-
- Pradhana, B. (2016). Translation methods of a fansub by Kyuubisubs of episode 74 of the Fairy Tail anime. *Jurnal Linguistik Terapan*, 13-25.
- Pérez-González L (2013) Co-creational subtitling in the digital media: Transformative and authorial practices. *International Journal of Cultural Studies* 16(1): 3–21
- Rong, L. Z., & OMAR, H. C. (2018). Understanding Fansub as One of the Audiovisual Translation Methods. *KEMANUSIAAN: The Asian Journal of Humanities*, 25(2).
- Saejang, J. (2021). Behind online Y counterculture: The role fansubbing groups and social actors play in driving online Y counterculture. *Journal of Language and Culture*, 40(1), 148-166.
- Tee, Y. H., Amini, M., Siau, C. S., & Amirdabbaghian, A. (2022). English to Chinese fansub translation of humour in The Marvellous Mrs. Maisel. *Texto Livre: Linguagem e Tecnologia*, 15, 1-21.